

EQUAL CITIZENSHIP AND INCLUSIVE POLICY: LESSON FROM FEMALE FISHERMEN MOVEMENT IN COASTAL AREA, INDONESIA

Ambar WIDANINGRUM

Associate Professor, Department of Public Policy and Management, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia
E-mail: ambarwid@ugm.ac.id

Dimas WAHYUDI

Research Staff, Communication and Partnership Division, Office of Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education, Indonesia
E-mail: dimaswahyudi07.dw@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the community movements of female fishermen, to obtain justice and fight discrimination for equal citizenship. Issuance of Indonesian Law concerning the protection of fishermen as a formal law to protect fishermen does not fully target female fishermen groups. One of the female fishermen movements in the coastal communities, which is joined by a community organization, was trying to request an adjustment of the occupation identity written in the National Identification Card (NIC) from housewife to fisherman to access the benefits of this law. Using four key dimensions of citizenship proposed by Stokke (2017), this paper seeks to fill a gap in the study of participatory and inclusive policy at the community level. We found that female fishermen experience unjust treatment in terms of recognition, welfare distribution, and political representation. They developed a shared identity based on their awareness of and encounters with unfair treatment, which is expressed in all four dimensions of citizenship, membership, legal status, rights, and participation. They learned a lot from this experience about how to identify each problem related to the four dimensions of citizenship, which serves as a strategy for developing and enhancing their sense of citizenship identity. Through a series of advocacy efforts and agreements, the recognition of female fishermen's citizenship is pursued to fulfill their requests. These female fishermen's initiatives to secure legal recognition of their identity employ transformative and affirmative strategies. This legal recognition will strengthen their access and other positive externalities,

particularly on the welfare distribution programs and political representation.

Keywords: *citizenship, gender equality, civic participation and representation, inclusive policy, Indonesia*

Introduction

Research in the field of public administration has changed and advanced significantly in recent years. There is a shift in public sector values away from efficiency and effectiveness and towards a paradigm that highlights equity, diversity, and social inclusion (Andrews, R., & Ashworth, R., 2015; McDonald III, et al., 2022). In this, though, gender equality is still a debated issue. The debate about the private and public domains related to the division of labor with women in the private domain and men in the public domain has been going on for a long time. The women's environment is considered the private domain of the home, children, spouses, and caregivers, with minimal interaction with the public domain. The male domain is the wider world of the public domain in business, government, and society (Kerber, 1988; Klein, 1996; Dorius & Firebaugh, 2010). This is also reflected in several studies on gender equality, law, and public administration which discuss the greater efforts of women than men and the less strategic role of women in the public domain (Stivers, 2002; Mahapatro, 2014; Carey & Dickinson, 2015; Alonso, 2017; Popovic, 2017; Khoma & Kozma, 2021; Selmani-Bakui, 2022). The results of these studies also influence women's efforts and strategies to strengthen their voices, especially the role of women's participation in policy proposals at the community level. However, studies related to women's bottom-up efforts in policy proposals have not been widely studied. Citizens are seen as quite capable of engaging in deliberative problem-solving that allows them to develop a public value and spiritedness (Bourgon, 2007; Ventriss, et al., 2019).

Women and men have been involved in fishery activities for a long time. Women are always involved in all economic elements of this activity, in fishing, processing, and marketing (Anna, 2012; Olufayo, 2012, Frangoudes & Gerrard, 2019), so their contribution also supports the family economy (Cliffe and Akinrotimi, 2015). Women not only play a role in the public sphere, for example working as breadwinners for the family, but women are also the main ones responsible for household domestic activities (Nwabeze et al., 2013; Chung & van der Lippe, 2020).

Although women have played a crucial role with their double burden in the public and domestic domains, female fishermen in coastal communities in Demak Regency, Central Java Province have not easily gained recognition as fishermen. Law No. 7 of 2016 concerning the Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers, and Salt Farmers is interpreted differently by village officials. The gender-biased perspective of the village officials has made them

reluctant to agree to the proposal and aspiration of female fishermen to change their occupation identity as written on the National Identification Card (NIC) from “housewife” to “fisherman”. The occupation identity written on the NIC is very important because it will strengthen one's citizenship, especially for socio-economic activities that require an occupation or professional identity. With their occupation identity as a housewife, they are often excluded from various protection and welfare programs that should be received by fishermen as a whole regardless of gender. Female fishermen have been going to sea for fishery activities in Demak Regency for decades. The involvement of women in fishery activities has become a common and accepted phenomenon, although it is not recognized or appreciated, and its contribution is not counted as much as men's (Obetta et al., 2007, Cliffe and Akinrotimi, 2015; Ibrahim et al, 2011).

This study seeks to fill a gap in the research of participatory and inclusive policy at the community level, especially in the female fishermen community in fighting for the same rights as male fishermen. More specifically, it aims to explain the activism of female fishermen who join the “Puspita Bahari” community to gain recognition and justice for those who are marginalized by the domination of the power actors. To obtain their rights, women need extra efforts to struggle through a long process and to endure conflict against their dominant actors (Holston, 2008; Holston, 2009). This study also seeks to ascertain that the activism of female fishermen is not only about an issue of recognition but also other issues related to the distribution of welfare and political representation of female fishermen as explained by Stokke (2017) that recognition, distribution of welfare and political representation as a motive or basis for gaining equal citizenship.

Literature Review

Concept of Citizenship

Discourses on citizenship vary widely in terms of definition and aspects of emphasis. Dagger (2002) and Kostakopoulou (2008) emphasize citizenship as an adjustment of individual roles in collective life. Citizenship describes the basic foundation of individuals in having rights or the right to have rights. Another study by Janoski and Gran (2002) emphasizes active involvement in public life as an important condition for the recognition and protection of human rights, and Tilly and Heater (in Kostakopoulou, 2008) include citizenship politics in specific relationships between citizens and state institutions. Hoffman (2004) emphasizes the study of citizenship on the potential of egalitarian and anti-hierarchical principles championed by marginalized groups, and Lister (2007) emphasizes the struggle for social inclusion as an important theme in the study of citizenship and activism. Citizenship is also a starting point in the shift in the theory of public administration (Bourgon, 2007), where people become frustrated because they

are treated as “reserve actors” and are excluded from elite groups and politicians in the policy process, thus causing demands in the community to be more actively involved. These various discourses lead to the conclusion that citizenship is always associated with the struggle for claims to the basic rights of the state.

Citizenship Dimensions

The struggle for basic rights claims is a basic element of the concept of citizenship, but the next question is what is being fought for in the citizenship activism movement itself. Stokke (2017) explains that substantive and institutionalized membership, legal status, rights, and participation are at the core of the citizenship movement. A broad notion of citizenship offers a conceptual basis for examining such struggles in a more integrative manner than the politics of citizenship. As Bellamy (2008) stated, they are struggling for cultural, juridical, social, and political justice, unlike previous understandings which often viewed citizenship as the basis for the formal status of citizens, rights, and active citizenship associated with this status.

Stokke (2017) identified four key interrelated dimensions of citizenship: membership, legal status, rights, and participation. The first dimension, membership, relates to the cultural inclusion of an individual in the community and emphasizes the distinction between who is inside and outside of a community. However, what needs to be considered is the meaning of the word "community" and the criteria for entering it are very different and change based on the context of space and time. The second dimension of citizenship as a legal status relates to juridical inclusion in the community of citizens. Stokke explained that legal status is a contractual relationship that raises rights and obligations between individuals and the state which are manifested in legal recognition as citizens and the difference between how the legal status is realized and what exists in the experience of individuals. The third dimension is citizenship as rights, related to membership status and legal status. Several experts offer various general categories of rights, for example, the typology proposed by Marshall (1950) which includes civil, political, and social rights.

The last dimension is citizenship is participation. This dimension is based on a communitarian perspective that brings individuals from the private sphere to the public sphere. Participation is important because it is the main supporter of democracy, decentralization, creating accountable governance, and the basis of governmental legitimacy (Darwin, 2016). The dimension of political participation not only emphasizes direct political activities related to public policy control mechanisms but also discusses how the citizens' representation is given considering that public policies are formulated by public officials elected through general elections or representative democracy. Therefore, the dimension of political participation must relate to representation, which is not only a matter of formal representation but also the significance of the votes affecting the interests and involvement of political representations at large.

In forming a full citizenship identity, the four dimensions described are interrelated. The relationship that Stokke means is that each of these dimensions

forms one another, as a point of departure for different potential priorities for both individual groups of actors and individual citizens. The process toward full citizenship is not an evolutionary process. It is seen as something linear or passing through certain stages. Each civic movement that appears in society will vary greatly in terms of triggers, strategies, and priorities to be fought for.

Injustice and Politics of Justice

In analyzing the political struggles of female fishermen communities, this study uses forms of injustice and the struggle for justice according to Stokke (2017) based on Nancy Fraser's analysis (1995, 2007) as follows:

Table 1. Forms of Injustice and Politics of Justice

Forms of injustice	Politics of justice	Remedies for injustice	
		Affirmation	Transformation
Maldistribution	Politics of redistribution	Welfare State	Socialism and/or social democracy
Misrecognition	Politics of recognition	Multiculturalism	Deconstruction
Misrepresentation	Politics of representation	Proportional representation	Substantive democracy

Source: Stokke (2017)

Fraser (1995) argues that the traditional model of justice, which focused primarily on the redistribution of wealth and resources, is no longer sufficient to address the new struggles for recognition based on cultural, gender, and identity-based claims. Fraser also paid attention to the dimension of political misrepresentation as a third form of injustice. Citizens or communities are unable to access the political arena to fight for aspects of redistribution and recognition. Then, Fraser (2007) proposed a two-dimensional approach to gender justice that incorporates both redistribution and recognition. She argues that recognition struggles, which aim to challenge cultural hierarchies and stereotypes and affirm the identities and experiences of marginalized groups, are essential to achieving gender justice alongside struggles for economic redistribution. Furthermore, Stokke provides answers on how strategies to improve representation justice, namely through strategies that are affirmative or transformative (Table 1). At the level of political procedure, affirmative

strategies can be emphasized by demands for quotas or proportional representation in liberal democratic electoral systems. Whereas in transformative political representation starting from the democratic goal of people's control over public affairs, the effort made is to transform the limitations faced by the people and create a substantive democratic relationship between the people and public governance.

Research Method

This study employed a descriptive research design, using a case study approach. The case study is used to develop an in-depth understanding of the problems and issues, to describe the setting, and events that occur, to map the actors involved, the activities, strategies, and relationships that are built between actors, the processes and changes that occur, and their implications for the actors (Creswell, 2014). This approach can present comprehensive information, not only answering the “what”, “how”, and “why” (Yin, 2016). The focus of this study is limited to the form of injustice, the civic activism movement that has been carried out, and the resolution strategy adopted, using Stokke’s model (2017) presented in Table 1. The case elaborated is the struggle to get recognition of equality from the female fishermen who are members of a community organization called *Puspita Bahari*, in Demak Regency, Central Java Province. Two categories of data were gathered: primary and secondary data. Primary data were carried out through a series of in-depth interviews. The secondary data collected came from a variety of sources, such as village documents, regulations, video documentaries, and news reports related to fishery activities in coastal areas and their surroundings in the Demak Regency. The variety of those secondary data was analyzed to increase the reliability of the data and to obtain a more complete portrait of the constraining aspects experienced by the female fishermen group.

Findings and Discussion

Women’s roles in fishery activities and limitations.

Women are the group most vulnerable to poverty in Indonesia. Support, protection, and capacity building for the fishing profession are facilitated by several government policies. There are at least four Indonesian Laws and one Presidential Instruction regarding fisheries sector regulations. Law No. 7 of 2016 which is currently used as a regulatory reference not only targets fishermen but also other groups that depend on marine and coastal resources such as fish cultivators and salt farmers. This law is gender-neutral, without mentioning a specific gender though throughout the law, the profession is called a fisherman. In Article 43, the word “women” is stated once, as the role of women is part of the fisherman's family businesses. This limitation of the role of women then becomes a problem in the process of being recognized as fishermen. Problems related to female fishermen issues are summarized in the following table:

Table 2. Issues in fishermen-related policies

No	Policy	Issues
1	Law No. 16 of 1964 concerning Fishery Production Sharing.	Legal subjects only include fishery owners, cultivators, pond owners, and pond cultivators.
2	Law No. 9 of 1985 concerning Fisheries was later renewed twice through Law No. 31 of 2004 and Law No. 45 of 2009.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> · The legal subjects are still fishermen and fishery cultivators. · Does not mention anything about the role of women in fisheries and marine activities. · There is no provision for any kind of protection on legal subjects.
3	Law No. 27 of 2007 concerning the Management of Coastal Areas and Small Islands is renewed through Law No. 1 of 2014.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Legal subjects are the general public living in coastal areas and small islands. · There is no explanation regarding the specific role of women. · It discusses community empowerment efforts but does not discuss protection efforts.
4	Presidential Instruction No. 15 of 2011 concerning the Protection of Fishermen.	This is the first policy that pays attention to the issue of fishermen's protection, including their families (involving 18 ministries, the Police Department, the National Land Agency, the Central Bureau of Statistics, Governors, and Regents/Mayors)
5	Law No. 7 of 2016 concerns the Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Cultivators, and Salt Farmers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> · The subject of law extends to include professions related to maritime affairs and fisheries such as fishermen, fish cultivators, and salt farmers. · There is an article in this Law that explains the protection guarantee. · The involvement of women is included but is limited to "fishermen's families" and ignores the existence of women who work as fishermen.

Note: the information in this table was compiled by the authors based on the contents of four Indonesian Laws and one Presidential Instruction.

The legal status dimension

The involvement of female fishermen in fishery activities is a social fact that has existed for decades on the coast of Demak Regency. However, during that time, the legal occupation identity for women which is written in the NIC was that of a housewife. The government and society itself have not realized that women can hold the status of fishermen. 31 female fishermen have attempted to change their occupation identity in the NIC, but they have not succeeded in obtaining a new NIC. Interviewing two female fishermen, they said that to come to the Village Head Office almost every day to ask about the clarity of the arrangement for their proposal (Interviewee I-01 & I-03). There seem to be three reasons related to the reluctance of the officer to approve the female fishermen's proposal to process a change in their occupation identity in the NIC. First, there are no formal written rules regarding women's jobs as fishermen. Second, the official doubts the truth that women are involved in fishery activities at sea. Third, whether the activities are the main profession or just helping their husbands or partners.

Efforts to request a change of their occupation identity in the NIC were carried out in various activities, directly or indirectly in cooperation with the news media. Several media also broadcasted the process, such as *Mongabay* and *Republika* (online newspaper), *360 Metro TV* (television program), and *Jurnal Perempuan* (video documentary). After the news spread, the village officials finally invited female fishermen and held a meeting at the Village Head's Office. The meeting, which was attended by 29 female fishermen, was described as a serious and tense discussion. Law No. 7 of 2016 was interpreted differently by both parties. The decision from the meeting was that the village government was willing to provide a letter of recommendation for changing their occupation identity in the NIC. Unfortunately, the recommended changes are written as "fishing laborers", not as "fishermen" as the initial demands. The protests then continued, and after the pressure from the community, the Village Head finally agreed to hold a second meeting which was attended by the head of the village fishermen group, activists from an NGO (People's Coalition for Fisheries Justice), and the female fishermen. During this meeting, the village official explained his reason for labeling "fishing laborers" based on his observation that these women go to sea to "help" their husbands as ship's crew, so it is more appropriate to be called laborers. Those who deserve to be called fishermen those who can prove ownership of fishing boats. This meeting ended without an agreement.

Continuous pressure from the villagers then forced the village official to change his decision. The involvement of the media also played a big role in this case, especially after the broadcast of a documentary video on one TV station, which shows how the daily life, challenges, burdens, and lack of guaranteed protection as a fisherwoman. After the recommendation letter from the Village Head's office was in hand, the female fishermen went to the Civil Registry Office to arrange for their new NIC and one week later, their new NIC was issued. From this information, it can be seen that the process is only stuck at the

village level, while other processes at higher-level institutions do not have any rejection as long as it fulfills the sequence of procedures.

Changing the occupation identified in the NIC from “housewife” to “fisherman” is very meaningful because access to various resources and rights, in the form of recognition, claims in the form of access to programs and equitable facilitation of fishermen's activities, as mandated in Law. The existence of the occupation as a fisherman in the NIC also allows female fishermen to obtain a Fishery and Marine Business Card. This card is a form of expanding protection and brings welfare to the fishery and marine business actors based on the Minister of Marine Affairs and Fisheries Regulation No. 39 of 2017. The exclusion of female fishermen from the target recipients of fishermen cards, which is formally proven through their occupation status in the NIC also means excluding them from the rights that can only be obtained from ownership of a fisherman card. From the perspective of an inclusive and anti-discrimination policy, female fishermen's existence must be protected.

The membership dimension

In addition to access to legal-formal membership cultural recognition in the community is also an obstacle experienced by female fishermen. In this case, reluctance to process changes in occupation identity in the NIC is due to a community culture that is still biased in defining gender roles. Previously, female fishermen did not have the awareness of being a fisherman even though they have been doing fishery activities for years. Being a fisherman is seen as an activity to 'help' a husband and her main task is to become a housewife. The prevailing construction of society assumes that if the wife goes to work it means that the husband is not capable of earning a family income. Women who go to sea and catch fish are considered to be a dishonor to fishermen's families, so they do not need to be voiced in the public sphere. Women who are active and vocal in their opinions are considered unusual and inappropriate because good women are those who live in the house and those who are active and vocal are riotous and inappropriate.

As mentioned by Stokke (2017), raising awareness, and strengthening self-identity is the empowerment strategy. This strategy is implemented in the routine activities of women in the community. The learning materials were delivered during *Puspita Bahari* activities such as monthly social gatherings by *Puspita Bahari* activists with various NGOs and other organizations concerned with environmental issues and gender equality. Increasing awareness of cultural membership is the basis needed to form female fishermen as a whole entity and includes solidarity related to the ability of individuals to recognize and be recognized in the same social unit. The construction of the identity of the female fishermen group as a subaltern group then forms it into a strong political agency and finally develops a movement for justice in the public sphere.

The rights dimension

The Fishery and Marine Business Card is the first condition for access to assistance and fishermen welfare improvement programs and without the card, female fishermen are excluded from the programs. One of the basic rights that are absent is fishermen's insurance guarantee, which women do not have, even though they have the same duties and risks as male fishermen. Several cases of work accidents have been experienced by female fishermen such as being hit by a large boat, loss, and damage to their fishing gear, almost drowning, and being bitten by a poisonous snake (interview with Interviewees I-02 and I-03). It is a different case if an accident is experienced by a male fisherman. Then the loss due to the accident can be covered by insurance and compensation. Apart from insurance guarantees, female fishermen are also excluded from various assistance and empowerment programs because their involvement requires fishermen's status in the NIC and ownership of the Card. All female fishermen in the community said that so far, they had never been involved in any training related to fishery activities held by the government.

This fact is perceived by female fishermen as a situation that traps women and fishermen's families, in general, in poverty. Women and children tend to depend on men when they are excluded from the opportunity to improve skills and health protection. This dependence is present in the uncertainty of the husband's income as a fisherman whose activities are strongly influenced by seasons (Conway et al., 2005). The condition of female fishermen's families and husbands as traditional fishermen also faces injustice in terms of fish catches.

The attention of female fishermen to nature is also an important form of citizenship rights and leads to a new form of "environmental citizenship", which is rights related to the quality and protection of the natural environment (Luque, 2005; Smith and Pangsapa, 2008). What these female fishermen do is actually in line with the provisions of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (Barcena, 1992) that fisheries management is defined as controlling the amount of overfishing and minimizing the impact of environmental damage from fishing equipment. Thus, the preservation of nature can be maintained as well as provide economic benefits for fishermen both in terms of size and type of fish according to market demand, and these traditional fishermen do not need to go fishing too far from their homes.

The participation dimension

In addition to claims to rights, citizenship also includes obligations or responsibilities. Along with being a member of the community is also the right to participate. The importance of participation is reflected in the notion of ideal citizenship. In our case study, it is a recognition of female fishermen's roles and the fulfillment of their rights in the practice of public life. An understanding of participation also requires an explanation of how far the government opens channels for public participation to control governance. The willingness of the government to provide channels of aspiration is following the concept of the

new public administration (Bourgon, 2007), that the role of government is no longer a representation of society but more than that, encouraging citizenship, discussion, and integrating the public in formulating appropriate and targeted policies. In practice community involvement in village meetings often fails to capture aspirations, even though the issues discussed are very urgent and crucial to community life, especially concerning the interests of female fishermen.

As mentioned by Interviewee I-02, female fishermen often regret that women's representation in village meetings is usually carried out by elites such as the wives of village officials. Another form of participation by female fishermen is their involvement at the hearing of the Central Java Fishermen Forum and the members of the Provincial Representative Council, which at that time was represented by the coordinator of the female fishermen community, *Puspita Bahari* (Interviewee I-04). When she expressed her opinion regarding the right to be recognized as a female fisherman and fishermen's insurance protection guarantee, this proposal was, unfortunately, not well responded to by members of the Provincial Representative Council. From these points, it can be concluded that the participation of female fishermen is still hampered by political representation. In a democratic system, participation is not only interpreted as the direct involvement of these female fishermen in the management of the public interest but also how their groups are represented in the decision-making process through aspirations, participation, and the significance of the voices of citizens in proposing public affairs or interests. The second issue of political representation concerns the significance of the voice of interest that can influence policy direction. The difference in interpretation of religious values and policies between the power holders and female fishermen certainly puts women's aspirations in an unfavorable position. According to Janoski and Gran (2002), community movements should be called the ideal type of citizen based on their political practices, namely participating citizens who support certain political elites or actively participate in mobilizing for political integration from the bottom.

Resolution strategy

The above discussion of the four dimensions of citizenship, it is mapped the forms of injustice experienced by female fishermen, using Stokke's typology of injustice (2017).

Table 3. Forms of injustice experienced by female fishermen

Forms of Injustice	Implications
Misrecognition	The occupation identity as a fisherman is not recognized in the NIC, only written as a housewife. Cannot hold a Fishery and Marine Business Card, so they cannot access service programs or government assistance for fishermen.
Maldistribution	Not eligible for fisherman insurance like that of male fishermen. There are no training and education programs for empowerment that are financed by the government. Inequality in treatment due to the use of environmentally unfriendly fishing gear, operated by fishermen with large boats.
Misrepresentation	Do not have formal representation in the legislative body or government that can contribute to the interests of female fishermen. Women's representation in village meetings does not stand for the substantial interests of female fishermen. Aspirations do not significantly influence village governance. Not free to organize and express opinions in public due to stigma.

Note: This table was edited by the authors based on data from the in-depth interviews with informants (Interviewees: I-01, I-02 & I-04).

Fraser (2007) describes a typology of conflict resolution based on citizenship issues, pursued through affirmation or transformation. Affirmative solutions are intended to change injustices in the social system without changing the underlying structures, whereas transformative solutions are concerned with fundamental changes and restructuring of the basic framework that results in injustice. In the case of the redistribution of welfare for female fishermen in the Demak Regency, the affirmative strategy is pursued by presenting and improving aspects of welfare, for example, education and training for processed catch products. The female fishermen then form a community or organization such as *Puspita Bahari*. This community can then work together so that its members (female fishermen) can access assistance

from outside parties such as corporate social responsibility (CSR) funds from various companies. The issuance of Law No. 7 of 2016 is an affirmative effort to redistribute welfare with a gender-neutral spirit, although its implementation may differ from the ideal goal.

In terms of recognition, it can be concluded that the interests of female fishermen are more likely to be pursued on the path of transformation, the use of the term “female fishermen” as a collective identity that still aims to change and dismantle the general public's perception that fishermen are not at all a profession suitable only for men. In addition, education and socialization that are mandatory for *Puspita Bahari's* agenda related to equality and gender roles for female fishermen and their husbands are also a form of transformative strategy to realize their identity and rights as female fishermen.

Through differences of opinion, conflict, and a series of protests, finally forcing the village government confirmed their interests by granting the change of occupation identity in the NIC. The decision of the village government that finally recognized the fishing profession for women was not only an affirmative effort in the recognition aspect but also reduced the problem of injustice in the aspect of welfare distribution. Legal recognition which is reflected through the occupational identity written on the NIC is the main door for female fishermen to access the benefits of the Fisheries and Maritime Business Card, and insurance guarantees, as well as several forms of other welfare protection as mandated by law.

Furthermore, related to efforts to resolve aspects of representation, affirmative strategies are pursued by proportional representation. Meanwhile, the transformative strategy is pursued through substantive democracy (Stokke, 2017). In the case of female fishermen, this transformative strategy becomes the backbone for the articulation of interests. As explained in the previous discussion, none of the representatives represented female fishermen, in terms of community identity and interests, even at a lower level such as village meetings. The existence of female fishermen is not well represented because their voices are not considered to represent the voices of women in their area. In this case, representation can be interpreted as an important medium in integrating and voicing various interests and other demands for justice. However, the results of the existing formal democracy have not been able to accommodate this goal. Therefore, it requires additional efforts, which are manifested through a series of protests and network efforts with organizations outside the village, such as NGOs, and news media, to attract the attention of a wider audience, which is an urgent need. From this phenomenon, it can be concluded that the transformative strategy is closely related to the movement of demands from female fishermen, while affirmative is the form of solution offered by the government.

Conclusion

Several points can be concluded from the above discussion. First, a collective identity can be built in the female fishermen community, formed based on their awareness and experience of being treated unfairly, which is reflected in each of the dimensions of citizenship (membership, legal status, rights, and participation). This experience is a tremendous lesson for them in recognizing each problem in the dimensions of citizenship, which in turn becomes the main strategy for building and strengthening their citizenship identity. The limited formal education that these female fishermen have is not an important issue because the community can build networks with outside organizations such as NGOs, which also helps them to broaden their insights and knowledge about the activism movement.

Second, the new occupation identity strengthens recognition aspects and other positive externalities, such as access to justice in welfare redistribution programs and political representation in other activities, so that the significance of their opinions in the public sphere can influence a more deliberative policy process. Three forms of demand for justice: recognition, redistribution, and representation can be successful because there is support from other actors such as popular media and advocacy from NGOs, which in turn lead to public sympathy and opinion, to increase their political bargaining power.

Third, the problem-solving strategy of requiring justice through the three forms of movement, recognition, redistribution, and representation, is pursued through different efforts. Strategies related to welfare redistribution are affirmative. Strategies related to the aspect of representation are carried out with transformative efforts, meaning that the community and its networks are directly involved in playing a control function in the public policy process. While with the strategy in terms of recognition, the efforts taken are transformative and affirmative strategies. The transformative strategy is carried out through labeling efforts as female fishermen as well as through educational and socialization activities regarding gender roles and equality for female fishermen and society in general. The affirmative strategy was carried out through a series of negotiations with and advocacy to the village government.

Acknowledgment.

This work got financial support from the Department of Public Policy & Management, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2022.

Disclosure statement

There is no conflict of interest or personal relationships that could have influenced the work reported in this paper.

References

- Alonso, Alba (2017) Who learns what from whom? Implementing gender mainstreaming in multi-level settings. *European Journal of Women's Studies* 24(2),174-188. doi:10.1177/1350506816632560
- Andrews, R., & Ashworth, R. (2015). Representation and Inclusion in Public Organizations: Evidence from the U.K. Civil Service. *Public Administration Review*, 75(2), 279-288. Retrieved March 13, 2023, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24757421>
- Anna, Z. (2012). The Role of Fisherwomen in the Face of Fishing Uncertainties on the North Coast of Java, Indonesia. *Asian fisheries science*, 25, 145-158.
- Barcena, Alicia (1992). UNCED and Ocean and Coastal Management. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 18 (1), 15-53. doi:10.1016/0964-5691(92)90050-U
- Bellamy, R. (2008). *Citizenship: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford University Press.
- Bourgon, J. (2007). Responsive, responsible, and respected government: towards a New Public Administration theory. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 73(1), 7-26. doi: 10.1177/0020852307075686
- Boatecă, Manuela and Julia Roth (2016) Unequal and gendered: Notes on the coloniality of citizenship. *Current Sociology Monograph*, 64(2), 191-212. doi:10.1177/0011392115614781
- Carey, Gemma and Helen Dickinson (2015) Gender in Public Administration: Looking Back and Moving Forward. *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 74 (4), 509-515 doi:10.1111/1467-8500.12172
- Chung, H., and van der Lippe, T. (2020). Flexible Working, Work-Life Balance, and Gender Equality: Introduction. *Soc Indic Res* 151, 365-381. doi: 10.1007/s11205-018-2025-x
- Cliffe, P.T., and O.A. Akinrotimi (2015). Role of Women in Fishery Activities in Some Coastal Communities of Rivers State, Nigeria. *International Journal of AgNICultural Research*, 10, 24-32. doi:10.3923/ijar.2015.24.32
- Conway, M. & Gelb, J. & Ahern, D. & Steuernagel, G. (2005). *Women and Public Policy: A Revolution in Progress*. Third Edition. Congressional Quarterly, Inc.
- Creswell, John W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (Fourth Edition), California: Sage Publication.
- Dagger, R. (2002). Republican Citizenship, in E. F. Isin and B. S. Turner (ed.) *Handbook of Citizenship Studies*. London: Sage Publication.
- Darwin, M. (2016). How participation shapes local development. *Populasi*, 24 (2), 37-66. doi:10.22146/jp.27229.
- Dorius, Shawn F; Firebaugh, Glenn (2010). The Trend in Global Gender Inequality. *Social Forces* 88(5), 1941-1968. doi 10.1353/sof.2010.0040

- Frangoudes, K., and Gerrard, S. (2019). Gender Perspective in Fisheries: Examples from the South and the North. In: Chuenpagdee, R., Jentoft, S. (eds) *Transdisciplinarity for Small-Scale Fisheries Governance* (pp 119-140). MARE Publication Series, vol 21. Springer, Cham. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-94938-3_7
- Fraser, Nancy (1995). From redistribution to recognition? Dilemmas of justice in a 'post-socialist' age. *New Left Review* 212, 68–93.
- Fraser, Nancy (2007). Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice. *Studies in Social Justice* 1(1), 23-35. doi:10.26522/ssj.v1i1.979.
- Hoffman, John. (2004). *Citizenship Beyond the State*. CA: Sage Publications.
- Holston, J. (2008). *Insurgent Citizenship: Disjunctions of Democracy and Modernity in Brazil*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Holston, J. (2009). Insurgent Citizenship in an Era of Global Urban Peripheries. *City & Society* 21(2), 245-267. doi:10.1111/j.1548-744X.2009.01024.x.
- Ibrahim H I, Kigbu A., and Mohammed R. (2011). Women's experiences in small-scale fish processing in Lake Feferuwa fishing community, Nasarawa State, Nigeria. *Livestock Research for Rural Development*. Volume 23, Article #42. Retrieved September 12, 2022, from <http://www.lrrd.org/lrrd23/3/ibra23042.htm>
- Janoski, T. and B. Gran. (2002) Political Citizenship: Foundations of Rights. In E. F. Isin and B. S. Turner (eds.), *Handbook of Citizenship Studies* (pp. 13-51). London: Sage Publications.
- Kerber, L. K. (1988). Separate spheres, female worlds, woman's place: The rhetoric of women's history. *The Journal of American History*, 75(1), 9-39. Retrieved December 10, 2021, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1889653>
- Klein, L. E. (1996). Gender and the public/private distinction in the eighteenth century: Some questions about evidence and analytic procedure. *Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 29 (1), 97-109. Retrieved December 10, 2021, from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/30053810>
- Khoma, N., and Kozma, V. (2021) Obstacles towards the achievement of gender equality in the Baltic States: Institutional and Value Dimension. *Balkan Social Science Review*, 18, 241-263. doi: 10.46763/BSSR2118241k
- Kostakopoulou, Dora. (2008). *The Future of Governance Citizenship*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Lister, Ruth. (2007) Inclusive Citizenship: Realizing the Potential. *Citizenship Studies*. 11(1), 49-61. doi:10.1080/13621020601099856
- Luque, Emilio (2005) Researching Environmental Citizenship and its Publics. *Environmental Politics*, 14(2), 211-225, doi:10.1080/09644010500054947
- Mahapatro, Meerambika (2014). Mainstreaming Gender: Shift from Advocacy to Policy. *Vision* 18(4), 309-15. doi:10.1177/0972262914551663
- Marshall, T H. (1950) *Citizenship and Social Class: And Other Essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- McDonald III, Bruce D. et al. (2022). The future of public administration research: An editor's perspective. Special Issue Article. *Public Administration* 100 (1), 59-71. doi:10.1111/padm.12829
- Nwabeze, G. O., Ifejika, P. I., Tafida, A. A. and Ayanda, J. O., ENIC, A. P. and Behonwo, N. E. (2013). Gender and fisheries of Lake Kainji, Nigeria. *A Review Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Science* 8(1), 9-13. doi:10.3923/jfas.2013.9.13.
- Olufayo, M. (2012). The Gender Roles of Women in Aquaculture and Food Security in Nigeria. *Tanzania Proceedings*. International Institute of Fisheries Economics and Trade (IIFET). Retrieved March 22, 2022, from https://ir.library.oregonstate.edu/concern/conference_proceedings_or_journals/5712mb936
- Popovic, Helena (2017). Gender equality struggle in Croatia: potentials and constraints in democratization processes. *Balkan Social Science Review*, 10, 63-77.
- Selmani-Bakiu, Arta (2022). Empowering women in the family: *sui generis* role of women in establishing a family and in parental responsibility. *Balkan Social Science Review*, 19, 69-89. doi: 10.46763/BSSR2219069s
- Smith, M.J. and Pangsap, P. (2008) *Environment and citizenship: integrating justice, responsibility, and civic engagement*. London: Zed Books.
- Sommers, M. R. (2008). *Genealogies of Citizenship: Markets, Statelessness, and the Right to Have Rights*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Stivers, Camilla. (2002). *Gender Images in Public Administration: Legitimacy and the Administrative State*. Second edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Stokke, Kristian (2017). Politics of citizenship: towards an analytical framework, *Norsk Geografisk Tidsskrift - Norwegian Journal of Geography*, 71(4), 193-207, doi:10.1080/00291951.2017.1369454
- Ventriss C., et al. (2019). Democracy, Public Administration, and Public Values in an Era of Estrangement. *Perspectives on Public Management and Governance*, 2(4), 275-282. doi:10.1093/ppmgov/gvz013.
- Yin, Robert K. (2016). *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish*, Second edition. New York: Guilford Press.

